



CHICAGO RABBINICAL COUNCIL

מועצת הרבנים דשיקגו

Divrei Torah for Chanukah 5783



DIVREI TORAH FROM



Rabbi Yona Reiss
My Chanukah



Rabbi Elisha Prero
*The Chanukah Miracle:
Is it the Oil, the Victory or Both?*

2701 W. Howard Street • Chicago, IL 60645
773-465-3900 • www.crcweb.org

NOW AVAILABLE!



SPECIAL EDITION HADROM JOURNAL

לזכר נשמת

זצ"ל HaRav Gedalia Dov Schwartz,
Rosh Av Beth Din of the
Chicago Rabbinical Council

INCLUDING TORAH ESSAYS FROM
INTERNATIONALLY RENOWNED RABBONIM
AND DAYANIM AND A COLLECTION OF
NEVER-BEFORE PUBLISHED TESHUVOS
FROM HARAV SCHWARTZ זצ"ל.

Edited by HaRav Yona Reiss

Av Beth Din, cRc



AVAILABLE FOR PURCHASE AT:



OR ONLINE AT WWW.SHOPCRC.ORG

My Chanukah

Rabbi Yona Reiss
Av Beth Din



The Gemora in *Masechet Shabbos* (21b) famously asks the question מאי חנוכה (“*Mai Chanukah*”) - what is Chanukah all about – and answers as follows:

דתנו רבנן: בכ"ה בכסליו יומי חנוכה תמניא אינון, דלא למספד בהון ודלא להתענות בהון. שכשנכנסו יוונים להיכל טמאו כל השמנים שבהיכל, וכשגברה מלכות בית חשמונאי ונצחום, בדקו ולא מצאו אלא פך אחד של שמן שהיה מונח בחותמו של כהן גדול, ולא היה בו אלא להדליק יום אחד, נעשה בו נס והדליקו ממנו שמונה ימים. לשנה אחרת קבעום ועשאום ימים טובים בהלל והודאה.

For our Rabbis taught: on the twenty-fifth day of Kislev [commence the] eight days of Chanukah, on which it is not permitted to eulogize or fast during these days. Because when the Yevanim [Syrian-Greeks] entered into the holy sanctuary they defiled all of the oils therein, and when the Royal Hasmonean House emerged triumphant over them, [the Chashmonaim] examined [the area] and found only one flask of oil that was stored with the seal of the High Priest, which only had sufficient oil to kindle [the menorah] for one day.

[However,] a miracle occurred with it and they were able to light from the oil for eight days. In the following year they established and made these days into festival days with the recital of Hallel and thanksgiving.

(Translation adapted in part from the Schottenstein Talmud & Soncino Talmud)

This passage appears to underscore the miracle of the flask of oil as the centerpiece of the celebration of the holiday of Chanukah. By contrast, the “*Al HaNissim*” prayer that is recited during the prayer service on Chanukah appears to focus more on the miracle of the military victory over the *Yevanim*:

ואתה ברחמיך הרבים עמדת להם בעת צרתם רבת את ריבם דנת את דינם נקמת את נקמתם מסרת גבורים ביד הלשים ורבים ביד מעטים וטמאים ביד טהורים ורשעים ביד צדיקים וזדים ביד עוסקי תורתך.

You in Your great compassion stood by them in their time of distress. You championed their cause, took up their grievance, judged their claim and avenged their wrong. You delivered the strong into the hands of the weak, the many into the hands of the few, the impure into the hands of the pure, the

wicked into the hands of the righteous and the arrogant into the hands of the diligent students of your Torah.

(Translation adapted from the Koren Siddur and the Artscroll Siddur).

There are three questions that come to mind:

(1) Why does the passage in the Talmud brush aside the miracle of the military victory and focus primarily on the miracle of the oil that burned for eight days? Wasn't the military victory much more critical for the continuing survival of the nation and therefore a much more compelling reason for the celebration of the holiday?

(2) Within the "Al HaNissim" prayer, there is clearly a miraculous quality to the fact that the "strong" were delivered into the hands of the "weak" or that the "many" were delivered into the hands of the "few." However, what is particularly miraculous about the fact that the "wicked" were delivered into the hands of the "righteous" or that the "impure" were delivered into the hands of the "pure?" Couldn't there have been certain "impure" warriors who were sluggish in battle and certain "pure" warriors who were comparatively mighty?

(3) Why did it take until "the following year" (literally, "another year") for the days of Chanukah to

become established as a permanent holiday?

To answer these questions, it may be helpful to analyze an obscure and fascinating *midrash* to a verse in *Shir HaShirim* (7:14) which is cited by the *Chassam Sofer* in his commentary to the Talmud (*Shabbos* 22a, s.v. "BaTefach"):

הדודאים נתנו ריח זה ראובן שנקרא דודאים ועל פתחינו כל מגדים זה מזוזה ונ"ח.
"The mandrakes emitted a fragrance" – this is [a reference to] Reuven (see *Bereishis* 30:14)... "And on our doorways are all delicacies [precious fruits]" – this is [a reference to] the *Mezuzah* and the Chanukah candle[s].

The *Pardes Yosef* (*Bereishis* 37:21), commenting on this *midrash*, ponders the contrast between Reuven and Chanukah. He explains that Reuven is associated with fragrance but not taste because while Reuven attempted to rescue his brother Yosef from the hands of Yosef's other brothers, he was not truly successful. As the result of his suggestion that Yosef be tossed in a pit, his brothers tossed Yosef into a pit full of snakes and scorpions (see *Rashi, Bereishis* 37:24) which could have killed him as well. Thus, while Reuven had the sweet fragrance of one who desires to do the right thing, he did not possess the delicious taste of one who actually succeeds in accomplishing his goal. By contrast,

the *Chashmonaim*, who precipitated the miracle and observance of the Chanukah candles, had both the righteous intention and ultimate success in vanquishing their enemies who sought to destroy the Jewish religion and defile the Holy Temple. Thus, they had both the fragrance and the delicious taste associated with the “delicacies” described in the *midrash*.

Interestingly, this explanation of the *midrash* seems to underscore a deficiency in the efforts of Reuven on behalf of his brother Yosef. Indeed, this understanding is reinforced by the following passage in the *Midrash Rabbah* on *Megilat Ruth* (*Parsha 5*):

א"ר יצחק בר מריון בא הכתוב ללמדך שאם אדם עושה מצוה יעשנה בלבב שלם שאלו היה ראובן יודע שהקב"ה מכתוב עלי (בראשית ל"ז) וישמע ראובן ויצילהו מידם, בכתפו היה מוליכו אצל אביו.

Rabbi Yitzchak son of Meryon said that the Torah comes to teach us that if a person does a mitzvah he should do it "Be'levav Shalem" – with all of his heart, for if Reuven had known that HaKadosh Barukh Hu would write about him (Bereishis 37) that "Reuven heard (his brothers' plans to kill Yosef) and rescued [Yosef] from their hands" he would have taken Yosef on his shoulder to his father.

(Translation adapted in part from Soncino edition of *Midrash Rabbah*)

This passage at first glance seems

troubling because it appears to suggest that Reuven was not sufficiently sincere in his efforts to rescue Yosef, and that he would have been motivated more had he known how much praise would be heaped upon him for his efforts. Can it be that Reuven was essentially a headline-seeker who would only perform *mitzvot* based on the honor that he would be accorded for them?

The commentary *Siach Yitzchok* on the Siddur (published in the *Siddur HaGra*), in his comments to the phrase “*U’Le’avdo Be’levav Shalem*” (in the prayer *U’Va L’Tzion*) - “that we should merit to worship Hashem with a perfect heart” – explains that Reuven unquestionably was sincerely motivated in his efforts to rescue his brother. However, it is possible that Reuven did not sufficiently appreciate the cosmic significance related to the rescue of his brother Yosef. Had he realized the true significance and Divine approbation of this heroic deed, as reflected by its recordation in the Torah, he would have performed his actions on a higher level of שלם – of full energy and excitement, which would have enabled the fulfillment of the *mitzvah* to reach its fullest potential.

Based on this insight we can appreciate the contrast between Reuven and the miracle of the Chanukah candles. Unlike Reuven, the *Chashmonaim*,

exemplifying the “delicacies at the doorways,” performed the *mitzvah* of the lighting of the candles of the Menorah with a full appreciation of the epic significance of their actions. Therefore, they acted with ardent passion and unadulterated zeal. Had they only focused on the narrow needs of the moment, they would have been content to celebrate their military conquest over the *Yevanim*. However, the military victory did not require special zeal. Of course the Jewish people would be saved from their prospective conquerors based on the principle of רוח והצלה יעמוד אחר ליהודים ממקום אחר – if not through the *Chashmonaim*, Hashem would have employed other means to save His people from annihilation. However, the miracle of the flask of oil was only made possible because of the zeal of the *Chashmonaim* in ensuring that, even in the aftermath of their victory, they performed the *mitzvah* of the lighting of the menorah in the optimal fashion.

Indeed, as the *Pe’nei Yehoshua* (*Shabbos* 21b, s.v. “*Mai Chanukah*”) famously points out, טומאה הותרה בצבור – “ritual impurity is permitted when dealing with the entire congregation” – according to the *halakha*, impure oil can be used when pure oil is not available for the lighting of the menorah. Why then, asks the *Pe’nei Yehoshua*, was there such a necessity to require a miracle

for the pure oil to last eight days when impure oil would have sufficed?

The *Chochmat Shlomo* (*Orach Chaim* 670:1), in response to the question of the *Pe’nei Yehoshua*, explains that the dispensation of טומאה הותרה בצבור only applies once the Holy Temple has been put into operation. In the inauguration of the Temple, everything must be absolutely perfect and impeccably pure. Accordingly, since the *Chashmonaim* were re-dedicating the Temple (the very name “*Chanukah*” – “dedication” is predicated upon this fact) they could not rely upon the utilization of impure oil even when there was an insufficient quantity of pure oil, and therefore needed the Divine intervention of a miracle to sustain the burning of the menorah with the limited quantity of pure oil for eight days.

This answer of the *Chochmat Shlomo* reinforces the message regarding the mindset of the *Chashmonaim* in the performance of the *mitzvah*. The lighting of the menorah was not just a regular *mitzvah* to be treated within the framework of typical *halakhic* rules; the *Chashmonaim* understood that the proper performance of this *mitzvah* was of immense historic significance. They were re-consecrating the holy Altar and the Temple grounds and laying the groundwork for the future spiritual

existence of their people. Their recognition of the significance of the moment and of their actions is what led them to have the zeal – the *לב שלם* – that triggered the miracle of the oil. Their zeal enabled the *mitzvah* to be performed *בהידורה* – to reach its greatest heights. It was this *מצוה* *בהידורה* – this *mitzvah* performed in the optimal fashion – that defined the magnitude of the military victory as well and ensured the lasting effect of their efforts. They recognized that at this moment in time when the Temple had become defiled – *ובאו* *בה פריצים וחלילה* – the only way to overcome the spiritual desecration in a lasting and meaningful fashion was to light the sacred menorah with oil of pristine purity, sealed with the signet of the High Priest.

We therefore understand why the essence of Chanukah, as described by the *Gemora*, was not the military victory but rather the miracle of the pure oil that burned for eight days. The military conquest alone would not have ensured a lasting imprint of holiness to overcome the defilement wrought by the *Yevanim*. It was only the realization of the *Chashmonaim* that they needed to “finish the job” by zealously and uncompromisingly re-dedicating the Temple in accordance with the utmost sanctity, that their actions led to an enduring victory.

In this vein, we can better appreciate

the terminology of the “*Al HaNissim*” prayer. Had the *Chashmonaim* not appreciated the significance of their task, and therefore not have achieved the same enduring victory, it would indeed have been inconceivable that the “impure” would have been vanquished by the “pure” or the “wicked” by the “righteous.” The exposure to a culture of defilement would have had a detrimental effect even upon those who waged battle with it, unless the warriors recognized that even after the military victory had to come a rejuvenated spiritual dedication to the performance of *mitzvot*. Therefore, we celebrate the miracle that even after exposure to the “impure,” the pure remained pure and the righteous remained righteous.

It is hence not merely as an afterthought that the “*Al HaNissim*” prayer mentions in its conclusion:

ואחר כך באו בניך לדביר ביתך ופנו את היכלך וטיהרו את מקדשך והדליקו נרות בחצרות קדשך וקבעו שמונת ימי חנוכה אלו להודות ולהלל לשמך הגדול.

And afterwards Your children entered the holiest part of Your house, cleansed Your Sanctuary and purified Your Temple, kindled candles in Your holy courtyards, and established these eight days of Chanukah to express thanks and praise to Your great Name
(Translation adapted from the Koren Siddur and Artscroll Siddur)

This passage represents the climax of the *Al HaNissim* prayer, clarifying that the reason we “established” the holiday of Chanukah for future generations was because the *Chashmonaim* did not stop with the military victory but rather “afterwards” recognized that they still needed to purify the Temple and ensure that the *mitzvah* of lighting the candles was fulfilled in the optimal fashion. Only then could a true spiritual re-birth take place and only then could their efforts have had an enduring effect sufficient to warrant the establishment of a permanent holiday.

Based on this insight, we can resolve our final question. Why was it necessary to wait for “the following year” before establishing a permanent holiday? The answer is that it is not always clear when a miracle occurs whether there will be a lasting and enduring effect that truly creates a spiritual elevation for *Klal Yisroel*. If an effort, even when resulting in a miracle, is not performed with the requisite *לב שלם* – with all of one’s heart, it may yield a fine smell but not a lasting taste. It was only after another year had elapsed and it became clear that the efforts of the *Chashmonaim* were indeed enduring (just as the *mitzvah* of *Mezuzah* described in the *midrash* is perennially affixed to the doorpost), that their zeal had

transformed the environment of the Temple from defilement to sanctity, that it was deemed appropriate to establish the days of Chanukah as festive days for future generations.

However, it is important to note that the *Gemora* states *קבעום ועשאו* – the festive days were not merely “established,” they were “made” to be days of praise and thanksgiving. Future generations were given the task to “make” Chanukah in its original image - to perform the *mitzvah* of the lighting of the candles with the same zeal as the *Chashmonaim* so that the victory of Chanukah continue to endure in modern times, so that the forces of purity continue to overwhelm the forces of defilement and contamination in the surrounding universe. Every generation must do battle with values antithetical to those of the Torah and settle for nothing less than the pristine holiness of perfect Torah observance. This explains why there is a special emphasis on Chanukah of performing the *mitzvah* of lighting the Chanukah candles in the manner of *מהדרין מן המהדרין* – in the most superlative possible fashion. When faced with the constant challenges of shifting moral values that threaten to unravel the fiber of Torah observance, we

Continued on page 11

The Chanukah Miracle: Is it the Oil, the Victory or Both?

Rabbi Elisha Prero

Rabbi Emeritus, Young Israel of West Rogers Park



The *gemara* in *Maseches Shabbos* (21b) famously asks “*mai Chanukah*” - what is Chanukah? Rashi explains that the *gemara*’s question is “Because of which miracle did the Rabbis establish Chanukah”?

The *gemara* answers that the *Chashmonaim* found only one cruse of oil with the seal of the *Kohen Gadol* (indicating it was pure) and that although it was only enough to burn for one day, a miracle occurred and they lit the menorah from it for eight days and the next year the Sages made those days a holiday with special prayers and blessing.

My rebbe, Rav Ahron Soloveichik, says that the *gemara* gives rise to three questions:

1. Had the Jews not found pure oil, *b'dieved*, they could have fulfilled the *mitzvah* of lighting the menorah with impure oil, since a public offering may be brought *b'tumah* – in impurity. So, why does the *gemara* consider the miracle of the oil to be the essential reason for celebrating Chanukah?

2. Why does the *gemara* not emphasize the victory of the Maccabees? Had the Maccabees not won the battle, *chas v'shalom*, the results would have been tragic. Why does the *gemara* ignore the military victory and instead considers the miracle of the oil to be the primary reason for the holiday of Chanukah?

3. Why did the Sages wait another year before formally establishing the holiday of Chanukah, rather than doing so while the joy of the events was fresh?

The *gemara* in *Shabbos* also cites the dispute between Beis Hillel and Beis Shammai about the number of candles we kindle each night of the holiday. Beis Hillel says the best way to light, *mehadrin min hamehadrin*, is to start the holiday with one candle on the first night and to add one each night, so that on the eighth night we light eight candles. Beis Shammai, on the other hand, says the best way to light is to kick off the holiday with eight candles the first night and to decrease that number by one each succeeding night. Beis Shammai

analogizes to Sukkos, during which the number of bulls sacrificed on the holiday decreased by one each succeeding day.

Rav Ahron observes that the reference to Sukkos is telling. Sukkos has two motifs. As *Chag Haasif*, the festival of gathering, Sukkos celebrates the harvest, the gathering and storing of produce, which engenders a sense of security. On the other hand, it is also *Chag Hasukkos*, the holiday of huts, the time we depart our secure homes to dwell in makeshift huts with roofs of largely useless material, unprotected from the elements. It's when we feel our greatest exposure to nature and dependence on G-d. *Chag Hasukkos* teaches that in a real sense, every person is a *ger*, a transient – like a *gargir*, a mere seed, tossed by nature – wind and water – which may find fertile soil and sprout into a fruitful plant, or may just as easily be destroyed. *Chag Hasukkos* teaches us that we are untethered, without mooring in the stable ground. *Chag Haasif*, on the other hand, teaches that a person is a *toshav*, one who is settled, with roots in the ground, in secure possession of the land. Rav Ahron says this was the meaning of Avraham Avinu's declaration, "*ger v'toshav anochi*" – I am at the same time a transient and a settler (*Bereishis* 23:4).

The message of *Chag Hasukkos*, of transience, is not just for the Jews. It is universal. Indeed, says Rav Ahron, the nations of the world who see themselves *toshavim*, and grant themselves license to abuse those they deem to be of inferior status, need to learn that they, too, are *gerim*. The Jews, who are treated by others as *gerim*, must learn they are also *toshavim*, for, as Chanukah attests, they have withstood the test of time.

How does one who is a *ger* become a *toshav* as well? Rav Ahron says one must become rooted and gain possession in both the material and spiritual worlds. One might do so through conquest (*kibbush*) or steady, organic growth (*chazaka*). Sometimes *kibbush* is necessary, but the resulting *kedusha* lasts only as long as the *kibbush* lasts. The *kedusha* that devolved upon *Eretz Yisrael* from Yehoshua's conquest ended when the Jews were forced out of the land. No *kibbush* in place, no *kedusha*. The *kedusha* resulting from the slow restoration of the land of Israel by the returnees from exile, however, retained its status of that *kedusha* that resulted from *chazakah*.

The Sages waited until "another year" to institute the holiday of Chanukah to emphasize the importance of the slow, deliberate, consistent development inherent in *chazakah*.

When we celebrate Chanukah we learn the lesson of the Macabean victory, of conquering when necessary, but we realize this is only a temporary measure. The important thing to emphasize is the lesson of the miracle of the oil, the lesson of *Chag Haasif* – of *toshavus*. We follow Beis Hillel - steadily adding a flame each night, gaining momentum with time – emphasizing *chazakah*. In contrast, in comparing the pattern of

lighting with that of the decreasing offering of bulls, Beis Shammai stresses *kibbush*, the effects of which weaken over time.

On Chanukah, we acknowledge the occasional need of *kibbush*, but our main celebration and our essential gratitude to Hashem is for the supreme benefit of *chazakah*, the very existence and continued survival of our people.

My Chanukah by Rabbi Yona Reiss

Continued from page 8

cannot settle for mediocrity in our religious and ethical conduct.

Indeed, we live at a time of shifting moral values, when foreign values penetrate our own communities, and pressure is placed upon Torah institutions to adopt contemporary mores that are antithetical to clear Torah principles. We must exercise the same zeal as the *Chashmonaim* to uphold our traditions and to cause our Chanukah candles, representing our unshakable values, to illuminate the world around us.

The *מהדרין* standard, as commonly observed, requires all members of the household to participate in the lighting of the

Chanukah candles (see Rema 671:2). In this sense, for each of us, *מאי חנוכה* in the year 5783 must become “my Chanukah” – all of us must internalize the message of Chanukah and utilize the holiday to re-energize our batteries to engage the universe as proud bearers of our holy heritage. Through this re-dedication every Chanukah, we strive to fulfill the level of *ועל פתחינו* *כל מגדים* – to provide illumination to all of mankind, in a manner that is fragrant and tasty, meaningful and enduring, and which inspires us to appreciate the significance of each *mitzvah* opportunity that presents itself throughout the entire year.

FROM THE DAYAN'S DESK

Featuring

Rav Yona Reiss, שליט"א

Av Beth Din of the Chicago Rabbinical Council

Weekly Shiur for Men
MONDAYS AT 8:00 PM

Cong. KINS • 2800 West North Shore Avenue • Chicago

- SPECIAL SERIES -

Halichos Regesh: Teshuvos of
HARAV GEDALIA DOV SCHWARTZ זצ"ל
גלב"ע כ"ד כסלו תשפ"א



December 19
Part 1
Orach Chaim

January 2
Part 2
Yoreh Deah

January 9
Part 3
Even Haezer

January 16
Part 4
Choshen Mishpat

